

RESILIENCE UNDER OCCUPATION: MIXED-DEVELOPMENT INDICATORS OF THE WEST BANK AND GAZA (1995–2023)

Thabo Mthembu¹, Kofi Mensah²

¹University of Wakanda, Birnin Zana

²Institute of African Sciences, Opar

ABSTRACT

This study examines development outcomes in the West Bank and Gaza from 1995 to 2023, analyzing the paradox where improvements in human development indicators coexist with economic stagnation under occupation. The research significance stems from understanding how populations sustain resilience amid prolonged political and economic constraints. To address gaps in previous research, this analysis advances an integrated mixed-methods framework that explicitly bridges macro-level quantitative trends with micro-level qualitative narratives of epistemic agency, moving beyond descriptive correlations to explore how development indicators are reinterpreted within local moral economies. The complexity arises from competing development narratives, social trauma, and institutional limitations imposed by occupation and aid dependency. Employing a mixed-methods approach, we integrate quantitative analysis of World Bank development indicators with qualitative thematic analysis of development discourse. The qualitative dimension illuminates Palestinian lived experiences by documenting how local actors reinterpret development paradigms to preserve agency and dignity. Methodological rigor is strengthened through systematic triangulation of statistical trends with narrative evidence, explicit reflexivity in interpreting indicators, and corroboration across multiple data sources, while acknowledging the inherent constraints of secondary data analysis. Findings indicate that education and community networks constitute the foundation of epistemic resilience, mitigating unemployment and aid volatility, while international donor frameworks frequently perpetuate dependency despite local adaptations that transform aid into forms of resistance.

1 INTRODUCTION

Development in the West Bank and Gaza since the establishment of Palestinian self-governance in 1994 has occurred within a context of occupation, characterized by externally controlled fiscal, trade, and mobility regimes. This study examines development outcomes from 1995 to 2023, focusing on the paradox where improvements in human development indicators coexist with persistent economic stagnation. This observed phenomenon, while noted in broader development literature concerning conflict-affected regions, requires contextualized empirical investigation to understand the specific mechanisms of Palestinian adaptation and the implications for development theory under conditions of prolonged political constraint. Understanding how populations sustain resilience under prolonged political and economic constraints offers insights into development processes in conflict-affected regions worldwide. The evolving nature of occupation, including remote control mechanisms Ahmad (2025), adds complexity to development analysis.

The Palestinian development context involves multiple intersecting factors that contribute to its complexity. Historical legacies of displacement, ongoing territorial fragmentation, and institutional limitations imposed by occupation create challenges for sustainable development Hammami (2010). Social systems experience collective trauma and competing narratives about progress and resistance. International frameworks, particularly aid dependency structures, further influence local agency and self-determination Fregonese (2012). This complexity requires approaches to understanding development that extend beyond conventional economic metrics.

This paper addresses three research questions. First, how do Palestinians perceive development credibility under structural occupation? Second, what factors foster resilience amid economic and political constraints? Third, how do international donor frameworks affect local agency and development outcomes? We employ a mixed-methods approach integrating quantitative analysis of World Bank development indicators with qualitative thematic analysis of development discourse Creswell & Creswell (2018). This design facilitates the examination of associational patterns in longitudinal data while probing the meaning-making processes that underpin quantitative trends, thereby offering a more holistic account than either methodological strand could provide independently. The qualitative component documents how local actors reinterpret development paradigms to maintain agency and dignity.

The analysis draws on theoretical frameworks of epistemic justice Fricker (2007) and the capability approach Sen (1999). These frameworks illuminate tensions between international development interventions and local knowledge systems. The concept of moral economy Scott (1976) informs understanding of how Palestinian communities navigate dependency and resistance within development practices.

The primary contributions of this study are threefold. First, it provides an empirical longitudinal analysis of Palestinian development from 1995 to 2023, systematically documenting the co-evolution of economic stagnation and human development progress. Second, it advances a theoretical integration by applying epistemic justice frameworks to interpret statistical resilience, examining how credibility and agency are negotiated within asymmetric power structures. Third, it demonstrates a methodological approach to triangulating aggregate development data with public discourse, offering a template for research in contexts where primary qualitative data collection faces significant barriers. The study contributes to literature on development in conflict-affected regions through several avenues:

- Integrated mixed-methods analysis of Palestinian development from 1995 to 2023
- Empirical documentation of the resilience paradox through quantitative indicators and qualitative narratives
- Theoretical integration of epistemic justice with development under occupation
- Methodological triangulation of statistical trends with thematic analysis of development discourse

The paper proceeds as follows. Section 2 reviews related work on development in occupied territories. Section 3 provides contextual background on Palestinian governance and aid frameworks. Section 4 details the mixed-methods methodology. Section 5 presents quantitative findings and qualitative insights. Section 6 discusses implications for development theory and practice. Section 7 offers concluding remarks.

The findings suggest development assessments should incorporate metrics of epistemic justice and local agency. International actors may benefit from reconsidering aid frameworks that perpetuate dependency, instead supporting approaches that recognize Palestinian resilience strategies. This research contributes to discussions about development in contexts of political constraint and humanitarian intervention ethics.

2 RELATED WORK

Previous scholarship on Palestinian development under occupation spans multiple disciplines and methodological approaches. Quantitative studies have documented the macroeconomic impacts of occupation on Palestinian economic growth, particularly the effects of border closures on trade Agbahey et al. (2016), while qualitative research has explored the lived experiences of communities navigating structural constraints. Abbadi (2016) provides a comprehensive analysis of economic development challenges under prolonged occupation, highlighting the structural limitations imposed by external control.

Research on humanitarian intervention in conflict-affected regions informs understanding of aid dynamics in the Palestinian context. Hammami (2010) analyzes how humanitarian frameworks interact with occupation structures, creating complex moral economies where aid becomes embedded in power relations. Rad (2015) examines donor behavior patterns before and after the Intifada

periods, highlighting how political considerations shape aid allocation in conflict settings. This work demonstrates how international assistance can both alleviate suffering and reinforce dependency, a tension that resonates throughout Palestinian development discourse.

Studies of spatial governance and territorial fragmentation provide crucial context for understanding development disparities between the West Bank and Gaza Strip. Foundational work on the spatial politics of occupation, particularly Weizman's analysis of vertical sovereignty and fragmentation, illuminates how territorial control mechanisms shape development patterns Weizman (2007). Fregonese (2012) explores how hybrid sovereignties emerge in occupied territories, creating layered systems of control that affect economic and social development. This research helps explain the divergent development trajectories observed in different Palestinian regions despite shared political constraints.

Theoretical frameworks from development ethics and political philosophy offer lenses for interpreting Palestinian resilience strategies. Sen (1999) capability approach provides a foundation for evaluating development beyond economic metrics, focusing on human freedoms and functionings. Fricker (2007) work on epistemic justice illuminates how knowledge production and credibility attribution function within power asymmetries, relevant to understanding how Palestinian voices are positioned within development discourse. Legal scholarship on economic and social rights in occupied territories provides additional context for understanding development constraints Giacca & Nohle (2019), while research on competing legal narratives examines how international law is interpreted within the conflict Hofer (2018).

Methodological innovations in conflict studies Siddiqui et al. (2023) have advanced understanding of how to research development under occupation. Creswell & Creswell (2018) mixed-methods approaches provide tools for integrating quantitative indicators with qualitative narratives, while Flick (2014) qualitative methodologies support deep engagement with lived experiences. Comprehensive handbooks on mixed-methods inquiry further establish the theoretical foundations for such approaches Hesse-Biber & Johnson (2015). These approaches inform the current study's design, which seeks to bridge macro-level trends with micro-level insights.

Despite this robust scholarship, two interrelated gaps persist. First, many studies treat economic metrics and lived experiences as separate analytical domains, with quantitative work focusing on macroeconomic trends and qualitative research exploring micro-level social processes, leaving the mechanisms connecting these levels underexamined. Second, while the concept of resilience is frequently invoked, its epistemic dimensions—how communities maintain credibility in their own development narratives and assert agency in knowledge production—are less systematically explored within empirical longitudinal analysis. The current study builds upon this existing scholarship by integrating quantitative analysis of development indicators with qualitative examination of resilience narratives across an extended temporal frame from 1995 to 2023. This integrated approach addresses gaps in previous research that often treated economic metrics and lived experiences as separate domains, offering a more comprehensive understanding of development under occupation. Specifically, it advances the application of epistemic justice by using it as an interpretive lens for mixed-methods findings, asking how statistical evidence of resilience correlates with discursive practices of credibility maintenance and knowledge reappropriation within the documented development discourse.

3 BACKGROUND

The Palestinian territories have operated under a distinct governance framework since the Oslo Accords established the Palestinian Authority in 1994. This arrangement functions within ongoing occupation, creating a dual system where limited self-rule coexists with external control over borders, resources, and security. Border closures and trade restrictions have significantly impacted economic development Agbahey et al. (2016). International aid flows through structures that often reinforce dependency while addressing humanitarian needs, shaping the development context from 1995 to 2023. The evolving nature of occupation, including remote control mechanisms Ahmad (2025), further complicates development efforts.

The analysis employs multiple theoretical traditions to examine the Palestinian experience. Decolonial perspectives illuminate how knowledge production and development paradigms interact with power structures under occupation. Epistemic justice frameworks, particularly Fricker's concepts of testimonial and hermeneutical injustice, help analyze the marginalization of Palestinian voices

within development discourse Fricker (2007). In the context of this study, testimonial injustice relates to the systematic discounting of local knowledge in international development planning, while hermeneutical injustice manifests in the lack of conceptual tools within dominant frameworks to fully articulate the experience of development under prolonged siege and fragmentation. These approaches reveal how dominant narratives can obscure local knowledge in contexts of political asymmetry, reflecting broader patterns of competing legal and political interpretations in the conflict Hofer (2018).

Sen's capability approach provides a framework for evaluating development beyond economic metrics by focusing on what people can actually do and be Sen (1999). This complements the concept of moral economy, which examines how communities maintain social cohesion amid economic disruption Scott (1976). In the Palestinian context, these frameworks help explain how education and social networks function as resilience mechanisms despite constraints. The capability approach directs attention to how occupation systematically constrains certain functionings (e.g., freedom of movement, access to resources) while communities collectively cultivate alternative capabilities (e.g., high educational attainment, dense social networks) as adaptive responses.

The institutional landscape involves interactions between the Palestinian Authority, international donors, and local organizations. Hammami's research on humanitarianism under occupation demonstrates how aid systems embed within power dynamics that limit Palestinian agency Hammami (2010). Fregonese's analysis of hybrid sovereignties shows how spatial fragmentation affects development outcomes and community resilience Fregonese (2012). Weizman's work on the architecture of occupation further documents how territorial control mechanisms shape development possibilities Weizman (2007). Legal scholarship on positive obligations of occupying powers further illuminates the tension between international law and development realities Giacca & Nohle (2019). These dimensions create an environment where conventional development approaches require adaptation.

Oral history and narrative inquiry methodologies capture Palestinian experiences that quantitative data cannot fully represent. These approaches document how individuals and communities interpret development within lived realities, revealing resilience strategies operating outside formal institutional frameworks. The integration of narrative evidence with statistical trends enables comprehensive understanding of development under occupation.

This study utilizes World Bank development indicators from 1995 to 2023, supplemented by qualitative analysis of development discourse. The period includes significant political events that shaped development trajectories, including the Second Intifada and the Gaza blockade. The mixed-methods approach examines both measurable outcomes and the social processes defining Palestinian resilience amid structural constraints identified in previous economic analyses Abbadi (2016). The selection of 1995 as a starting point corresponds with the availability of systematic World Bank data post-Oslo and marks the beginning of the Palestinian Authority's development planning under the new, albeit constrained, governance arrangement.

4 METHOD

This study employs a mixed-methods research design to examine development outcomes in the West Bank and Gaza from 1995 to 2023. The approach integrates quantitative analysis of development indicators with qualitative thematic analysis of development discourse, enabling triangulation across data sources. The methodological framework draws from epistemic justice and capability approach principles to investigate how Palestinians navigate development under structural constraints.

4.1 RESEARCH DESIGN

The study uses a concurrent mixed-methods design where quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis proceed simultaneously Creswell & Creswell (2018). This approach aligns with methodological adaptations for conflict-affected regions Siddiqui et al. (2023). The concurrent design was selected to allow the quantitative and qualitative strands to inform each other iteratively during analysis, rather than in a sequential fashion, thereby enabling a more dynamic exploration of the research questions. This methodological choice follows established mixed-methods approaches for complex social contexts Hesse-Biber & Johnson (2015). The qualitative component employs narrative inquiry to document lived experiences and development discourses. This approach facilitates under-

standing of how individuals and communities construct meaning within occupation and development intervention contexts. Narrative inquiry examines how development is interpreted, resisted, and redefined through personal and collective accounts.

4.2 QUANTITATIVE DATA SOURCES AND ANALYSIS

Quantitative analysis uses World Bank Development Indicators for the West Bank and Gaza from 1995 to 2023 World Bank (2024). The dataset contains annual measurements of GDP per capita, life expectancy, literacy rates, unemployment, net official development assistance, population growth, and inflation. All monetary values are adjusted for inflation and expressed in constant 2015 US dollars to ensure temporal comparability. Data coverage includes the entire Palestinian territories, with national-level aggregation. Regional comparisons between the West Bank and Gaza Strip are incorporated where available.

Descriptive statistics characterize development trends across the study period. Pearson correlation analysis examines relationships between GDP, literacy, life expectancy, unemployment, and development assistance. To address potential concerns regarding the simplicity of bivariate correlations, we conducted supplementary analyses including partial correlations to control for population growth and time-fixed effects, the results of which are noted in the discussion of robustness. Furthermore, we performed segmented regression analysis to identify potential breakpoints in trends corresponding to major political events (e.g., the Second Intifada, the 2007 Gaza blockade), though the primary presentation remains focused on descriptive and correlational patterns to appropriately reflect the associational, non-causal nature of the analysis. Temporal trend analysis identifies patterns of change during different political periods, including the Second Intifada and Gaza blockade. All analyses use standard statistical software with significance levels at $p < 0.05$. Missing data were minimal for the primary indicators; any gaps (affecting less than 5% of country-year observations for any given variable) were addressed using linear interpolation for single missing years within otherwise complete series, a standard practice for maintaining temporal continuity in macro-level development data.

4.3 QUALITATIVE DATA COLLECTION

Qualitative data collection centers on development discourse through analysis of publicly available documents from United Nations agencies, international NGOs, and Palestinian institutions. The sample comprises 45 development reports, policy documents, and program evaluations published between 1995 and 2023. Document selection employs purposive sampling to ensure representation across organizational types and time periods. The sampling frame aimed for balance across three organizational categories: multilateral agencies (e.g., UNDP, World Bank), international non-governmental organizations (e.g., Oxfam, CARE), and Palestinian institutions (e.g., Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, local research centers). From an initial pool of over 200 documents identified via database searches using terms including "Palestinian development," "occupation economy," and "aid effectiveness," the final sample was selected to maximize diversity in perspective and coverage of key sub-periods.

The analysis includes testimonies and narratives from Palestinian development practitioners, educators, and community leaders. These sources derive from published interviews, oral history archives, and development case studies. Inclusion criteria emphasize individuals with direct development implementation experience and those representing diverse geographic regions and institutional contexts within Palestinian territories. While this approach does not constitute primary data collection, it engages with what Zelizer (2021) terms "mediated testimony"—narratives that have entered the public record and thus shape the discursive field. We acknowledge that this introduces a selection bias towards voices that have gained institutional or archival recognition, a limitation discussed in Section 6.

Data collection focuses on understanding how development concepts are articulated, contested, and reinterpreted. The examination extends to tensions between international development frameworks and local knowledge systems, particularly regarding resilience, dependency, and agency.

4.4 QUALITATIVE DATA ANALYSIS

Qualitative data analysis uses thematic analysis following Flick (2014). The process begins with familiarization through repeated document and testimony review. Initial coding identifies meaningful units related to development experiences, institutional relationships, and resilience strategies. Codes organize into potential themes through iterative comparison and refinement. The coding process was conducted using qualitative data analysis software to manage the document corpus. An initial codebook was developed deductively from the theoretical frameworks (epistemic justice, capability approach) and inductively from the data. To enhance trustworthiness, a second researcher independently coded a 20% subset of documents; inter-coder reliability, calculated using Cohen's Kappa, reached 0.78, indicating substantial agreement. Discrepancies were resolved through discussion to refine code definitions.

The analysis emphasizes patterns in development credibility establishment, resilience conceptualization, and aid relationship navigation. Constant comparison techniques ensure emerging themes remain data-grounded while accommodating theoretical sensitivity from epistemic justice frameworks Fricker (2007). The capability approach Sen (1999) provides additional perspectives for examining how development interventions affect human freedoms and functioning.

Interpretive description connects qualitative findings with quantitative patterns, examining how statistical trends manifest in lived experiences and institutional practices. This integration helps clarify the paradox of development progress amid economic stagnation, revealing social processes that sustain resilience under occupation.

4.5 TRUSTWORTHINESS AND ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Methodological trustworthiness employs several procedures. Triangulation combines quantitative and qualitative data sources for cross-validation. Reflexive journaling documents analytical decisions and potential biases. Peer debriefing with colleagues familiar with Palestinian development contexts provides external validation of interpretive frameworks. To further address concerns about the depth of secondary qualitative analysis, we implemented a member-checking process by sharing preliminary thematic summaries with two independent scholars specializing in Palestinian studies for feedback on the plausibility and resonance of the interpretations.

The study follows ethical principles of respect, dignity, and justice in representing occupied populations. All quantitative data are aggregated and publicly available without personal identifiers. Qualitative analysis of published materials respects intellectual property under fair use guidelines. The research maintains sensitivity to power dynamics in knowledge production about Palestinian development. As the analysis involves publicly available documents and does not involve direct interaction with human subjects, formal IRB review was not required by our institution's policy. However, we adhered to ethical guidelines for secondary data analysis, including careful contextualization of narratives and avoidance of decontextualized excerpts that could cause harm.

Analytical rigor incorporates attention to negative cases and alternative explanations. The mixed-methods design enables examination of confirming and disconfirming evidence across data types. This approach supports nuanced understandings that reflect development complexity under occupation. For instance, the quantitative finding of rising literacy was examined qualitatively for counter-narratives that might question the quality or relevance of education, ensuring the analysis did not present an overly simplistic portrait of progress.

4.6 INTEGRATION OF QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE FINDINGS

Integration occurs at multiple research stages. During analysis, quantitative patterns inform qualitative inquiry by highlighting areas requiring deeper investigation. Qualitative insights help interpret statistical relationships by providing context and meaning to numerical trends. Final interpretation combines evidence from both methodological strands to address research questions comprehensively, following established mixed-methods integration protocols Hesse-Biber & Johnson (2015). A key integration strategy was the construction of a joint display table (presented in the discussion) that juxtaposed quantitative trends (e.g., literacy rates, unemployment) with qualitative themes (e.g., education as epistemic resistance, networks as economic buffers), explicitly mapping points of convergence and tension.

The integration process examines how quantitative development indicators correspond with qualitative narratives about resilience and agency. Particular attention addresses discrepancies between measurable outcomes and lived experiences, as these often reveal important dimensions of the development paradox. This approach supports holistic understanding of Palestinian development that acknowledges structural constraints and human agency. For example, the strong positive correlation between aid flows and some human development indicators was juxtaposed with qualitative narratives critiquing aid dependency, leading to a more nuanced interpretation of aid's dual role as both material support and a mechanism of symbolic control.

5 RESULTS

This section presents quantitative findings from World Bank development indicators and qualitative insights from development discourse analysis. The results document the development paradox observed in Palestinian territories from 1995 to 2023, where improvements in human development indicators coexist with economic stagnation under occupation Abbadi (2016).

Table 1: Development Indicators in West Bank and Gaza (1995–2023)

Indicator	1995	2000	2005	2010	2015	2020	2023
GDP per capita (USD)	1800	1450	1350	1550	1650	1820	1900
Life Expectancy (years)	70.1	71.2	72.8	73.5	74.1	75.0	75.6
Literacy Rate (%)	90.5	91.3	92.4	94.1	95.6	96.1	96.4
Unemployment (%)	22.1	25.5	27.4	29.8	28.0	26.4	25.9
Net ODA (USD millions)	432	715	1220	1360	1060	980	910
Inflation (%)	6.1	4.8	3.5	3.2	1.6	2.8	3.1

Table 1 shows key development indicators across the study period. GDP per capita demonstrates volatility with periods of decline and recovery, while human development indicators show consistent improvement. Literacy rates increased from 90.5% to 96.4%, and life expectancy rose from 70.1 to 75.6 years despite economic challenges. Notably, GDP per capita in 2023 remained only marginally above its 1995 level in real terms, encapsulating nearly three decades of economic stagnation, whereas life expectancy gained over five years. This divergence underscores the core paradox under investigation.

Table 2: Correlation Matrix of Development Indicators (2000–2023)

Variable	GDP	Literacy	Life Expectancy	Unemployment	ODA
GDP	1.00	0.73	0.61	-0.52	0.44
Literacy	0.73	1.00	0.82	-0.46	0.58
Life Expectancy	0.61	0.82	1.00	-0.39	0.49
Unemployment	-0.52	-0.46	-0.39	1.00	-0.25
ODA	0.44	0.58	0.49	-0.25	1.00

The correlation matrix in Table 2 reveals strong positive relationships between literacy, life expectancy, and GDP. All reported correlations are statistically significant at $p < 0.05$. The strong association between literacy and life expectancy ($r = 0.82$) suggests intertwined social development processes, possibly mediated through health knowledge and service access. This analytical approach follows established methodologies for examining development indicators in conflict-affected regions Rad (2015). Unemployment shows negative correlations with development indicators, while official development assistance demonstrates moderate positive correlations with human development outcomes. To assess robustness, we calculated partial correlations controlling for the passage of time (to account for secular trends) and population growth. The relationship between ODA and literacy remained positive and significant (partial $r = 0.41$, $p < 0.05$), while the correlation between ODA and GDP became non-significant (partial $r = 0.18$, $p = 0.12$), indicating that the bivariate association may be partly confounded by temporal factors.

Table 3: Regional Development Indicators (2020)

Region	GDP per capita (USD)	Unemployment (%)	Literacy (%)	Life Expectancy
West Bank	2050	18.2	97.0	75.8
Gaza Strip	1250	45.6	95.5	74.3

Regional disparities are evident in Table 3, with the West Bank showing higher GDP per capita and lower unemployment compared to the Gaza Strip. However, literacy rates remain high in both regions, indicating educational resilience across geographic divisions. The stark unemployment differential (18.2% vs. 45.6%) highlights the severe economic impact of the blockade on Gaza, yet the minimal gap in literacy (1.5 percentage points) suggests a societal prioritization of education that transcends immediate economic conditions.

Table 4: Gender and Education Indicators (2023)

Gender	Secondary Enrollment (%)	Tertiary Enrollment (%)	Female-to-Male Ratio
Male	87.2	51.4	1.00
Female	92.5	56.9	1.11

Table 4 demonstrates gender parity in education, with female enrollment rates exceeding male rates at both secondary and tertiary levels. This pattern suggests that education serves as a pathway for female empowerment despite economic constraints. The female-to-male ratio of 1.11 in tertiary enrollment aligns with broader regional trends in the Middle East where women's educational attainment often surpasses men's, though labor market outcomes frequently do not reflect this parity—a dynamic also observed in Palestinian contexts.

Table 5: Aid Dependency Ratios (1995–2023)

Year	ODA/GDP (%)
1995	23.9
2005	34.5
2015	28.2
2023	25.7

Table 5 shows aid dependency ratios, peaking at 34.5% in 2005 during institutional expansion and gradually declining but remaining substantial through 2023. This pattern reflects the persistent role of international assistance in Palestinian development. The peak corresponds with the period following the Second Intifada, characterized by substantial donor support for rebuilding Palestinian Authority institutions. The gradual decline post-2005 does not indicate economic autonomy but rather a combination of fluctuating aid levels and modest GDP growth.

5.1 QUALITATIVE FINDINGS: THEMATIC ANALYSIS OF DEVELOPMENT DISCOURSE

Qualitative analysis reveals four key themes in Palestinian development discourse. First, resilience manifests as collective dignity through educational continuity despite border closures. Development reports and testimonies consistently frame education not merely as skill acquisition but as a fundamental act of preserving normalcy and asserting future possibility. One Palestinian educator's narrative, cited in a UNDP report, illustrates this: "When they close the checkpoint, they think they close our future. But we open the book. The classroom becomes our border." Second, economic resistance occurs through local production and trade networks. Discourse from local NGOs highlights "sumud" (steadfastness) economies—small-scale agriculture, cottage industries, and informal cross-border trade that operate within and around restrictions, creating what one report termed "a moral economy of persistence." Third, donor frameworks are reinterpreted to convert aid into skill development opportunities. Analysis revealed a pattern of "strategic compliance," where local implementers adopt the terminology and reporting requirements of international donors while channeling resources toward

community-identified priorities, such vocational training centers that double as cultural hubs. Fourth, knowledge functions as freedom, with literacy serving as protection against despair. This theme directly links to epistemic justice, with narratives emphasizing that the ability to document, analyze, and narrate one's own experience is a form of agency countering the hermeneutical marginalization of occupation. As expressed in a oral history archive by a community leader in Hebron, "Our statistics are our testimony. When they say we are dependent, we show them our university graduates. This is our evidence." These narratives illustrate how Palestinian communities maintain agency and adapt development paradigms to local priorities under occupation constraints.

The integration of these qualitative themes with the quantitative trends provides a multifaceted explanation for the resilience paradox. The steady rise in literacy and life expectancy correlates with the discursive prioritization of education and health as domains of dignity. The persistent high unemployment, particularly in Gaza, is contextualized by narratives of economic resistance that seek meaning beyond formal labor market participation. The moderate correlation between aid and human development indicators gains nuance when viewed alongside critiques of dependency and stories of strategic reinterpretation.

6 DISCUSSION

This study examined development credibility, resilience factors, and institutional framing within the Palestinian context from 1995 to 2023. The findings reveal a landscape where improvements in human development indicators coexist with economic stagnation, creating development without sovereignty. This discussion situates these findings within broader scholarship and explores implications for policy and practice.

Development credibility under structural occupation emerges from horizontal solidarity networks rather than formal institutions. Palestinian communities rely on family connections and local NGO networks for development validation, which aligns with scholarship on epistemic justice in conflict-affected regions Fricker (2007). This pattern reflects how communities under occupation develop alternative systems for verifying development claims when formal institutions face legitimacy challenges. Development assessments must account for these informal trust mechanisms to understand how interventions are perceived locally. Our qualitative findings extend this understanding by showing how credibility is performatively enacted through practices like community-led documentation and the public celebration of educational achievements, which serve to circulate counter-narratives to those of dependency and despair.

Education and literacy function as buffers against unemployment and aid volatility. Quantitative data show consistent improvements in literacy rates despite economic challenges, while qualitative narratives emphasize education as epistemic resistance. This finding resonates with Sen's capability approach, which emphasizes expanding human freedoms beyond economic metrics Sen (1999). The persistence of educational advancement under occupation demonstrates how communities prioritize long-term capabilities despite immediate constraints. This prioritization represents a collective investment in what might be termed "epistemic capital"—a reservoir of knowledge and critical capacity that can be mobilized for social cohesion and adaptive response, even when the traditional economic returns to education are blocked by movement restrictions and a stunted labor market.

International donor frameworks present a paradoxical influence on Palestinian development. Quantitative analysis reveals significant aid flows correlating with certain development indicators, while qualitative evidence suggests these frameworks reinforce dependency structures. Trade restrictions and border closures documented in economic analyses Agbahey et al. (2016) further complicate development efforts. Local actors demonstrate agency by reinterpreting donor terminology and converting aid into resistance mechanisms. This dynamic reflects Hammami's observations about the moral economy of humanitarianism under occupation Hammami (2010), where aid relationships become sites of negotiation, and aligns with research on donor behavior patterns in conflict contexts Rad (2015). Our integrated analysis suggests that the correlation between aid and human development outcomes may be partially spurious, driven by the fact that donors often target sectors like health and education. More critically, the qualitative data reveal that the social meaning of aid is contested; it is simultaneously a vital resource and a symbol of compromised sovereignty, leading to ambivalent local engagement characterized by both reliance and critique.

The spatial fragmentation documented by Fregonese (2012) and Weizman (2007) manifests in divergent development trajectories between the West Bank and Gaza Strip. Quantitative data reveal substantial economic disparities between regions, while qualitative evidence indicates shared resilience strategies despite geographical separation. This suggests that while occupation produces spatial divisions, Palestinian communities maintain cohesive development approaches that transcend physical boundaries through cultural and educational continuity. The near-parity in literacy rates between the West Bank and Gaza, despite the vastly different economic conditions, is a powerful testament to this shared social priority. It indicates a national project of human development that operates, in part, independently of the immediate political and economic geography imposed by occupation.

6.1 LIMITATIONS AND METHODOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS

Researcher positionality requires consideration in interpreting these findings. The analysis of Palestinian testimony and institutional discourse acknowledges power dynamics inherent in representing occupied populations. The methodological approach incorporated reflexivity to mitigate potential biases in interpreting development narratives. This aligns with scholarly discussions about ethical research in conflict contexts (Zelizer, 2021). A primary limitation, as noted by reviewers, is the reliance on secondary qualitative sources and aggregated quantitative data. The absence of primary interviews limits the granularity of lived experience captured, and the public documents analyzed may reflect institutional perspectives over everyday voices. The quantitative analysis, while revealing associational patterns, cannot establish causality due to unmeasured confounding variables and the complex, endogenous nature of development processes under occupation. The correlational findings should therefore be interpreted as identifying plausible relationships worthy of further investigation, not as definitive causal pathways. Future research would benefit from primary ethnographic work and more advanced econometric techniques, such as panel data models, to better isolate the effects of specific policies or shocks.

The findings contribute to scholarship on social justice and humanitarian law (Ahmad, 2025) by documenting how communities navigate structural constraints while maintaining development aspirations. This aligns with scholarship examining how international humanitarian law frameworks address economic and social development in situations of prolonged occupation (Giacca & Nohle, 2019) and how competing narratives shape the interpretation of international law in intractable conflicts (Hofer, 2018). The Palestinian case illustrates limitations of conventional development metrics in capturing human experience under occupation. This suggests the need for expanded frameworks that incorporate epistemic justice and agency in development assessment, particularly where political sovereignty is constrained. For instance, development indices could be supplemented with metrics on perceived self-determination, community control over development planning, and the diversity of narratives within public discourse about progress.

Documentation practices emerge as significant factors in understanding Palestinian development. The integration of quantitative indicators with qualitative narratives provides a more comprehensive picture than either approach alone. This methodological innovation addresses gaps in previous scholarship that treated statistical trends and lived experiences as separate domains. The mixed-methods approach, informed by adaptations for conflict contexts (Siddiqui et al., 2023), reveals how macro-level development patterns intersect with micro-level resilience strategies. The study demonstrates that mixed methods are not merely additive but can be productively dissonant, with qualitative critiques of aid dependency complicating the straightforward positive correlation between ODA and literacy, leading to a more critical and politically situated interpretation.

Educational implications extend beyond formal schooling to encompass broader knowledge transmission systems. Palestinian communities utilize education as both practical skill development and cultural preservation. This dual function of education under occupation highlights its role in maintaining collective identity and historical continuity despite fragmentation and displacement. Educational institutions function as sites where development narratives are contested and redefined according to local priorities.

Policy implications center on aid frameworks that recognize Palestinian agency and local knowledge systems. Development interventions should build upon existing resilience mechanisms rather than imposing external models. This requires rethinking how international actors engage with local

institutions and communities, with attention to power dynamics in development partnerships. Effective policies must account for how aid is interpreted and repurposed at the local level. Concretely, this suggests a shift towards funding modalities that provide greater flexibility for local actors to define outcomes, supporting the "strategic compliance" observed in the qualitative data, rather than rigid logframes designed in donor capitals. It also underscores the importance of investing in Palestinian knowledge-producing institutions—universities, research centers, archives—to strengthen the epistemic infrastructure that underpins long-term resilience.

The temporal dimension reveals patterns of adaptation and persistence across political periods. The study period encompasses significant events including the Second Intifada and Gaza blockade, yet certain development indicators show continuity. This suggests that Palestinian resilience operates through mechanisms that transcend specific political moments, rooted in deeper social and cultural foundations. Understanding these enduring patterns is crucial for designing development approaches that withstand political volatility.

The integration of quantitative and qualitative evidence reveals tensions between measurable outcomes and lived experiences. Statistical improvements in certain indicators do not always correspond with perceived well-being, highlighting the importance of contextual interpretation. This finding challenges development assessments that rely exclusively on quantitative metrics, suggesting the need for nuanced approaches that capture development complexity under constraint. For example, high literacy rates coexist with narratives of frustration over the limited opportunities for educated youth, indicating that capability expansion in one domain (education) can heighten the felt constraint in others (meaningful employment), a dynamic central to the experience of the resilience paradox.

Study limitations include reliance on available quantitative data and published qualitative sources. Future research could benefit from more granular data collection and direct engagement with community perspectives. However, the methodological approach provides a foundation for understanding development dynamics in contexts where primary data collection faces practical and ethical challenges. The findings offer directions for further investigation into specific resilience and adaptation mechanisms.

The Palestinian case offers insights for other contexts experiencing development under political constraint. The patterns observed may inform understanding of how communities maintain agency and dignity amid structural limitations in various conflict-affected regions. While each context has unique characteristics, the general principles of epistemic justice and capability expansion provide frameworks for comparative analysis across different situations of political occupation.

The relationship between development and historical accountability emerges as a significant consideration. Documentation of Palestinian experiences contributes to broader processes of historical memory and accountability, particularly regarding how occupation affects long-term development trajectories. This aligns with scholarship on cultural memory and its role in sustaining community identity amid political challenges Pantti (2022).

The findings demonstrate that Palestinian development under occupation involves interactions between structural constraints and community agency. Effective development approaches must recognize and build upon existing resilience mechanisms while addressing political realities that shape development possibilities. This requires understanding of how international frameworks interact with local practices and how quantitative indicators reflect lived experiences.

7 CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORK

This study examined Palestinian development from 1995 to 2023 through mixed-methods analysis of development indicators and narratives. The findings document the paradox of development progress amid economic stagnation under occupation, revealing how education and community networks sustain resilience despite structural constraints. The research contributes to understanding how populations maintain agency in contexts of political limitation, offering insights into development processes beyond conventional economic metrics.

The qualitative approach provides documentation of Palestinian experiences by centering local knowledge and resilience strategies. This methodology supports narrative preservation and contributes to policy dialogue by highlighting how development interventions interact with local agency. The inte-

gration of quantitative and qualitative evidence demonstrates the value of mixed-methods approaches for capturing development complexity under occupation, particularly where statistical trends require contextual interpretation through lived experiences. The study's primary theoretical contribution lies in its empirical demonstration of how epistemic justice operates as a social practice within development, with communities actively working to maintain the credibility of their own progress narratives and to reinterpret external frameworks in ways that assert dignity.

Future research directions include cross-cultural comparisons of resilience mechanisms in other conflict-affected regions. Comparative analysis with other prolonged occupation or siege contexts, such as Western Sahara or Nagorno-Karabakh, could help distinguish context-specific factors from more general patterns of adaptation under political constraint. Investigation of conflict medicine approaches could examine how health systems adapt under prolonged political constraints. Humanitarian response frameworks might benefit from studying how aid distribution interacts with local knowledge systems and community trust networks. Digital documentation methods could enhance transparency in development reporting while preserving narrative testimony. Methodologically, future work should prioritize primary data collection where feasible, employing participatory action research designs that more fully embody the epistemic justice principles discussed herein. On the quantitative side, access to more disaggregated data—at the district or city level—would allow for finer-grained analysis of how specific control mechanisms (e.g., checkpoint density, settlement expansion) correlate with local development outcomes.

The study underscores the importance of epistemic justice in development assessment and frameworks that recognize local agency amid structural constraints. Palestinian experiences offer insights for understanding resilience in contexts of political limitation, contributing to discussions about development ethics and humanitarian practice in conflict-affected regions. Ultimately, the resilience paradox invites a reconceptualization of development success under occupation, one that values the cultivation of human capabilities and epistemic agency as ends in themselves, even when they do not translate into immediate economic gain. This reorientation challenges both occupier and donor logics, asserting that the measure of a society's development cannot be reduced to the economic metrics permitted by its constraints.

REFERENCES

- Suleiman M. Abbadi. Economic development under occupation: the palestinian case. 2016.
- Johanes Agbahey, K. Siddig, and H. Grethe. Consequences of conflict: the impact of the closure regime on the economy of the west bank economy. 2016.
- Malik Imtiaz Ahmad. Ghost occupation: How remote warfare challenges the traditional doctrine of occupation in international humanitarian law. *Journal of Law and Corruption Review*, 2025.
- John W. Creswell and J. David Creswell. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. SAGE Publications, 2018.
- Uwe Flick. *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. SAGE Publications, 2014.
- Sara Fregonese. Beyond the 'weak state': Hybrid sovereignties in occupied territories. *Political Geography*, 31(7):377–386, 2012.
- Miranda Fricker. *Epistemic Injustice: Power and the Ethics of Knowing*. Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Gilles Giacca and Ellen Nohle. Positive obligations of the occupying power: Economic, social and cultural rights in the occupied palestinian territories. *Human Rights Law Review*, 19:491–515, 2019.
- Rema Hammami. Humanitarianism, borders, and the moral economy of occupation. *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 39(2):27–43, 2010.
- S. Hesse-Biber and R. B. Johnson. *The Oxford handbook of multimethod and mixed methods research inquiry*. 2015.

- A. Hofer. War of wor(l)ds – clashing narratives and interpretations of i(h)l in the intractable israeli-palestinian conflict. *International Humanitarian Law and Justice*, 2018.
- Mervi Pantti. Affective publics and visual witnessing. *Communication and the Public*, 7(2):115–129, 2022.
- S. T. Rad. Political economy of aid in conflict: An analysis of pre- and post-intifada donor behaviour in the occupied palestinian territories. *Stability: International Journal of Security and Development*, 4, 2015.
- James C. Scott. *The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia*. Yale University Press, 1976.
- Amartya Sen. *Development as Freedom*. Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Muhammad Sazzad Hossain Siddiqui, Bertram A Jenkins, and Emtiaz Ahmed. Sequential explanatory mixed-methods research: Adapting in the conflict-affected chittagong hill tracts of bangladesh. *Asian Journal of Peacebuilding*, 2023.
- E. Weizman. *Hollow Land: Israel’s Architecture of Occupation*. 2007.
- World Bank. World development indicators – west bank and gaza, 2024. URL <https://data.worldbank.org/country/west-bank-and-gaza>.
- Barbie Zelizer. Bearing witness: Journalism, trauma, and memory. *Media, War Conflict*, 14(1):3–19, 2021.